

The Discerner

the voice of... **Religion Analysis Service**

A QUARTERLY EXPOSING
UNBIBLICAL TEACHING & MOVEMENTS

Volume 29, Number 2

April • May • June 2009

Eckankar
Confucianism

Hare Krishna

Freemasons

Jehovah's Witnesses

Humanism

Jainism

Judaism

Neopaganism

MOONIES

Univeralism

Wicca

Islam

Exposed!

MORMONS

BAHA'I FAITH

Buddhism

Scientology

Satanism

In This Edition:

Report On Editor's Trip to Latvia 2

Dear Reader 3
By Rev. Laurence J. Sutherland

With This Issue 4
By Rev. Laurence J. Sutherland

The Untold Story: Muslims
Converting Worldwide. 5
By David Dunlap

Sacred Marriage or Secret Affair?
Part I 11
By Sandra Tanner/Salt Lake City Messenger

Quiz: Connecting Cults/Religions
with Geography 30



*"Hereby know we the spirit of truth
and the spirit of error" 1 John 4:6*

The Discerner

Volume 29, Number 2
April • May • June 2009

Editorial Committee

Rev. Laurence J. Sutherland
Dr. William A. BeVier

Religion Analysis Service Board Members

Dr. Ronald E. McRoberts: President
Ronald B. Anderson: Treasurer
Rev. Laurence J. Sutherland
Editor of "The Discerner"
Rev. Steve Lagoon: Vice President/
Secretary
Rick Dack
Steve DeVore

1313 5th St. SE, Suite 126E,
Minneapolis, MN 55414-4504
612-331-3342 / 1-800-562-9153
FAX 612-331-3342

Published Quarterly
Price \$10.00 for 4 issues
Foreign subscriptions extra

Religion Analysis Service Board Of Reference

Dr. William A. BeVier
Rev. Ron Carlson
Dr. Norman Geisler
Dr. Roy Knuteson



REPORT ON EDITOR'S TRIP TO LATVIA

In the last issue of The Discerner I mentioned that I planned to visit Latvia in order to assist in the establishment of a correspondence school there. God blessed the trip with success. Leaders from Latvia, Germany, and the USA were present for the consultation. We achieved remarkable unity as we discussed all aspects of this enterprise: purpose, structure, personnel, financing, and the practical day by day running of distance education. The glad results include initial funding anchored, several personnel assigned for its development, and a tentative structure of courses set up for both lay students and those in full time ministry. Courses for Latvian-speaking Latvians and Russian-speaking Latvians are foreseen. The Russian courses could be used in other Russian-speaking countries in Eastern Europe as well.

Hopefully, one of the first courses written will be one on Confronting the Cults and Aberrant Movements since Eastern Europe has been systematically infiltrated by cults such as Jehovah's Witnesses, the Mormons, Scientologists, et.al. since the fall of Communism in 1989. Your prayers for the start of the correspondence school in October 2009 are appreciated.

Laurence J. Sutherland

DEAR READER

Over the years I have made some general observations about cults and aberrant movements that I wish to submit to you for your reflection and reaction.

It is interesting that cults pattern themselves after the culture or country of their origin. For example, the Mormons and their trek from New York State to Salt Lake City, Utah epitomize the pioneering spirit of early America in the “go West, young man, go West!” mindset. The German cult, the New Apostolic Church, represents uniquely the German focus on structure and discipline, and Theosophy typifies the mystical philosophy of the Russian Madame Bovary.

It is true too that cults can pop seemingly out of nowhere, but generally they develop “out of” and “in” Christian contexts. Noteworthy are the warnings of the Apostle Paul to the Ephesian elders: “Therefore take heed to yourselves and to all the flock, among which the Holy Spirit has made you overseers, ... For I know this, that after my departure savage wolves will come in among you, not sparing the flock. Also from among yourselves men will rise up, speaking perverse things, to draw away the disciples after themselves” (Acts 20:28-30).

Cults appear to take advantage of Christian weaknesses. For instance, the growth of the Jehovah’s Witness organization is often the strongest in Roman Catholic areas where vital biblical knowledge is obscured by dubious doctrines, liturgy, and tradition. Scientology and the so-called Youth Religions flourish where a younger generation is uncertain or ignorant of biblical teaching and is fascinated and tantalized by exotic Asian/Indian mysticism.

Why do so many cults have their origins in the West, particularly the USA? There is good reason for this: The West allows for freer expression, also in religious matters. Traditionally we resent authoritarianism. Americans love innovation and diversity. However, the Bible defines the boundaries. There is both “thus saith the Lord” and also “where the Spirit of the Lord is there is liberty” (2. Corinthians 3:17). Freedom and authority/accountability go hand in hand.

As we confront the cults, we are mindful that we battle with powerful, unseen forces (Ephesians 6:12). But thank God that “greater is He who is in us than he who is in the world” (1. John 4:4).

WITH THIS ISSUE

A good number of religious articles come to my desk for review and assessment for publication in *The Discerner*. The two articles included in this issue originate from publications that also deal with religious analyses that expose and confront aberrant teachings.

David Dunlap's account of the conversion of Muslims to Christianity is especially encouraging to the many Christian ministries that have reached out to Muslims in all parts of the world in the last few decades. Indeed, the Lord is calling out people from all nations to be His redeemed Church (Acts 15:14). Dunlap reports from reliable and substantial sources how Muslims are turning to Christ as never before. This is not the normal news we hear these days, rather we hear the opposite – that more and more nominal Christians are accepting the Muslim religion (see Western Europe). Dunlap challenges that assertion. The reasons given for this turnaround might surprise us and also delight us.

The second article is the result of intensive research on Mormonism by Sandra Tanner, who boldly and copiously documents the history of Joseph Smith's polygamous "revelations" and practice. The dark cloud of polygamy has dogged Mormonism from its very outset, even after polygamy was declared unlawful by the US government in 1890. From media accounts we understand that polygamous marriages are still practiced in isolated areas in our Western states. The secret rites in Mormon temples are also contributory to the suspicions that polygamous marriage is still sanctioned.

The quiz links geography with dominant religious group or practice. Please tell us if you achieved 100%.

Laurence J. Sutherland

THE UNTOLD STORY: MUSLIMS CONVERTING WORLDWIDE

by David Dunlap

The mainstream news media has missed what may be one of the more important news stories to come out of the Arab world. Firsthand reports are indicating that Muslims are converting to Christ in large numbers in Arab lands. The news media continues to report that Islam is the world's fastest growing religion. On one hand, this is undoubtedly true. For example, USA TODAY recently reported that Muslims, for the first time, outnumbered Roman Catholics 19.2% to 17.4% as a percentage of the world population. Muslims now number approximately 5 million in France and nearly 1.6 million in England. Muslim families in many countries, especially Western Europe, have a high birthrate, giving the appearance that Islam is growing. The truth is, however, that Islam as a religion, when measured by conversion increase, is not growing but rather decreasing. More and more Muslims than ever before are becoming disillusioned with Islam. An increasing number of Muslims are beginning to question the validity of the Qur'an and the extremist teaching of Islamic teachers. Many are finding that the mechanistic rituals of praying five times per day, reciting verses that they do not understand, and frequent fasting are not a means to becoming more spiritual, and are taking a serious look at Christianity.

Every day, thousands of Muslim intellectuals are leaving Islam. They find Islam inconsistent with science, logic, human rights, and ethics. However the exodus from Islam is not reserved to the intellectuals alone. Today many average Muslims are finding that Islam is not the way to God, but the way to ignorance, poverty, and war. Millions of Muslims living in the Middle East, Africa, and Western Europe already have left Islam. This may be just the beginning of a mass exodus from Islam. They are leaving Islam to embrace other religions, especially Christianity. How many Muslims are converting to Christianity? It is impossible to give exact figures. However, a few years ago, a leading Muslim cleric stated that the number of Muslims who have converted to Christianity in recent years might be measured in the millions.

The Number of Muslims Converting to Christianity

Muslims throughout the Arab world are coming to Christ in record numbers. Former Muslim Paul Ciniraj Mohammed of India reports that more than 10,000 Muslims accepted Jesus Christ as their personal Savior throughout India last year (2007) alone. The Bible Society of India is publishing thousands of New Testaments for Muslims in different Indian languages including Tazi, with their own terminology and vocabulary.

Islam Watch, the largest support organization of ex-Muslims, reports that in Iraq, more than 5,000 Muslim converts to Christianity have been identified since the end of major combat operations. Fourteen new churches have opened in Baghdad, along with dozens of new churches opening in Kurdistan, some of which have 500 to 800 members. Thousands of Muslims have turned to Christ and are worshipping the Lord Jesus in Morocco, Somalia, Indonesia, Thailand, Malaysia, Singapore, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Saudi Arabia, UAE, and Maldives. Moreover, nearly one million Egyptians have come to Christ during the past decade. Recently Ramez Atallah, the General Secretary of the Bible Society of Egypt, reported “Egyptians are increasingly hungry for God’s Word; the Egyptian Bible Society used to sell about 3,000 copies of the Jesus film a year in the early 1990s. As per the figures taken from the Millennium campaign in 2000, they sold 600,000 copies, plus 750,000 copies of the individual cassette tapes (in Arabic) and about a half million copies of the Arabic New Testament.”⁽¹⁾

In December 2001, the al Jazeera Network, the Arabic language satellite television network serving the Middle East broadcasted a live interview with a leading Saudi cleric Sheikh Ahmad al Qataani. Maher Abdallah, the host of the program “Islamic Law and Life” interviewed Sheikh al Qataani, president of *The Companions Lighthouse for the Science of Islamic Law* in Libya, on the subject of Muslims converting to Christianity in Africa. During the interview, al Qataani stated that alarming numbers of Muslims are turning to Christ. “...There are now in Africa 1.5 million churches whose congregations account for 46 million people. In every hour, 667 Muslims convert to Christianity. Everyday, 16,000 Muslims convert to Christianity. Every year, 6 million Muslims convert to Christianity.” Stunned, the interviewer Maher Abdallah interrupted the cleric. “Hold on! Let me clarify. Do we have six million converting from Islam to Christianity?” Al Qataani repeated his assertion. “Every year,”

the cleric confirmed, adding, “a tragedy has happened.”⁽²⁾ *(Note: These numbers may be inflated to incite violence against Christians)*

Joel C. Rosenberg & Conversions in the Arab World

Journalist and respected Middle East expert Joel C. Rosenberg knows the Middle East mindset and its culture as well as anyone. For over twenty years, he has lived and worked in the Middle East, first as a journalist and later as a communications strategist for former Israeli Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu. More recently he authored the New York Times best-selling book *Epicenter: Why Current Rumbblings in the Middle East Will Change Your Future*. His organization and internet blog “Joshua Fund” are devoted to providing up-to-date information on what God is doing in the Arab world. Recently, he has interviewed numerous Arab, Iranian, and evangelical leaders in the Middle East. Their testimonies describe a dramatic resurgence of Christianity in a region that is extremely hostile to it. Rosenberg writes, “More Muslims converted to faith in Jesus Christ over the past decade than at any other time in human history. A spiritual revolution is underway throughout North Africa, the Middle East, and Central Asia. As a result, a record number of ex-Muslims are celebrating Christmas this year, despite intense persecution, assassinations, and widespread church bombings.”

“Last Christmas, I had the privilege of visiting the largest Christian congregation in the Middle East, which meets in an enormous cave on the outskirts of Cairo. Some 10,000 believers worship there every weekend. *(Note: The majority of these are not Muslims, persecution is still strong in Egypt.)*

A prayer conference the church held in May 2005 drew some 20,000 believers.” In other places in the Arab world, we find the same pattern of conversion. “There were only 17 Christians from Islam in Afghanistan in 2001. But there are more than 10,000 believers at present. Every week dozens of baptisms are being held there. In 1990, there were only three known Christians in Kazakhstan and no Christians in Uzbekistan, but now there are more than 15,000 in Kazakhstan and 30,000 in Uzbekistan. There were only 500 Christians in Iran in 1979, but more than one million Iranians believe in Jesus Christ today, most of whom meet in underground house churches.”⁽³⁾ Many are wondering why Muslims are converting to Christ in such large numbers.

Why Are Muslims Coming to Salvation in Christ

Dr. J. Dudley Woodberry, professor of Islamic Studies at Fuller Seminary in California, has been studying missionary outreach into the Muslim world for thirty years. Dr. Woodberry, aware that throughout the world Muslims have been turning to Christ in large numbers, was curious about the reasons for these conversions, especially in countries where the cost of converting is so high. To find the answer, he created a detailed questionnaire. Over a 16-year period, some 750 Muslims from 30 countries responded and the results are surprising.

1. NUMBER ONE REASON - The number one reason Muslim converts listed for their decision to follow Christ was the lifestyle of the Christians living among them. As Professor Woodberry, Russell Shubin, and G. Marks write in *Christianity Today*, Muslim converts noted that “there was no gap between the moral profession and the practice of Christians” they knew. An Egyptian convert contrasted the love shown by Christians with “the unloving treatment of Muslim students and faculty he encountered at a university in Medina.” Other converts were impressed that “Christians treat women as equals” and enjoy loving marriages. And poor Muslims observed that “the expatriate Christian workers they knew had adopted, contrary to their expectations, a simple lifestyle.” They wore locally-made clothes and abstained from pork and alcohol, so as not to offend Muslim neighbors.

2. NUMBER TWO REASON - Muslim converts identified “the power of God in answered prayers and healing.” For instance, in North Africa, a Muslim family asked Christian neighbors to pray for a sick daughter; and then the girl recovered. Some converts noted “deliverance from demonic power” as another reason they were attracted to Jesus. Dreams and visions were also reported by many Muslim converts. Converts also mentioned unhappiness with Islam itself, especially the Qur’an’s emphasis on God’s punishment and the uncertainty of salvation. By contrast, Woodberry notes, the biblical teaching that God loved us so much that “He sent His Son as an atoning sacrifice for our sins” is deeply attractive to Muslims. Converts are also attracted to “the love expressed through the life and teachings of Christ.” Ironically, Muslims initially heard about Christ through the reading of the Qur’an, but later turned to the Gospels to learn more about salvation in Christ.

3. NUMBER THREE REASON - The final and most important point is this: “When Christ’s love transforms committed Christians into a loving community, many Muslims (identified) a desire to join such a fellowship.” Woodberry’s research shows that when the church is being the church, testifying of the love of Christ and His transforming power, then Muslims are drawn to salvation in Christ. ⁽⁴⁾

When is the last time you welcomed a Muslim family to the neighborhood, or invited a Muslim co-worker for a cup of coffee? Even though we are in the midst of a worldwide war against Islamicbased terrorism, we must never forget Christ’s command to witness to our neighbors, especially our Muslim neighbors.

Conclusion

At the present time, God is moving in a remarkable way among Muslims throughout the world. Moreover, the opportunities to reach the four million Muslims in our own cities and neighborhoods has never been greater. The immigration of Muslims to the United States presents a unique opportunity to reach them for Christ. Southern Baptist Missions researcher Dr. Jim Murk (author of *Islam Rising The Never-ending Jihad Against Christianity*) estimates that 20,000 Muslims come to Christ each year in America. May the Lord use our gospel efforts to reach Muslims for Christ here and throughout the world.

Endnotes

1. <http://www.islam-watch.org/leavingIslam/muslims2Christianity.htm>
2. Interview with Sheikh Ahmad al Qataani, on the al Jazeera Network, *Islamic Law and Life* program, Dec. 2001.(The English transcript of the entire interview is available from Bible & Life upon request.)
3. Joel C. Rosenberg, <http://joshuafund.blogspot.com/2008/03/big-untold-story-in-middle-east-2008.html> - March 23, 2008
4. J. Dudley Woodberry, Russell G. Shubin, and G. Marks, “Why Muslims Follow Jesus,” *Christianity Today*, 24 October 2007, pp. 80-85

Suggested Reading

1. Joel C. Rosenberg, *Epicenter: Why Current Rumbles in the Middle East Will Change Your Future*, Wheaton, IL: Tyndale House Publishers, 2006

2. Paul Bramsen, *One God One Message*, Orlando, FL: Xulon Press, 2007

David Dunlap is a author and Bible teacher from Tampa FL. He is the editor of *Bible & Life Newsletter*, and has authored three books “The Glory of the Ages” and “Limiting Omnipotence”, and “His Dying Request.

Used by permission.

SACRED MARRIAGE OR SECRET AFFAIR?

PART I

By Sandra Tanner / Salt Lake City Messenger

Joseph Smith and the Beginning of Mormon Polygamy

Joseph Smith, the founder of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, was born to a poor farm family on December 23, 1805, in Vermont. Given his humble beginning no one would have suspected that one day he would issue revelations, found a religion, and marry thirty-eight women in a new order of plural marriage.

In studying Joseph Smith's life one is left to wonder when he first puzzled over the issue of polygamy in the Bible. In the earliest account of Smith's childhood he mentions that he studied the Bible from an early age:

At about the age of twelve years my mind become seriously imprest with regard to the all important concerns for the welfare of my immortal Soul which led me to searching the scriptures believeing, as I was taught, that they contained the word of God.¹

No doubt he had read in Genesis and Kings of Abraham, Jacob, David and Solomon's extra wives. It certainly was on Smith's mind in 1828 and 1829 when he dictated the Book of Mormon passage denouncing polygamy unless directed by God.²

While there are examples of polygamy in the Old Testament there is no evidence that the practice was commanded by God or was a doctrine to be obeyed. Plural marriage in Mormonism, on the other hand, was always connected to their doctrine of eternal marriage and exaltation, not just a social practice. Following the lives of Biblical polygamists one is struck by the troubles it brought into their relationships. And so it was with Joseph Smith.



**Joseph Smith's Nauvoo Mansion
where he took in boarders.**

A Double Standard

Throughout Joseph Smith's life the LDS Church continually insisted that its standard for marriage was one man and one wife. However, behind the scene Smith had a very different agenda. Richard Van Wagoner observed:

Smith never publicly advocated polygamy. New Testament monogamy, the official church position throughout his lifetime, was clearly outlined to the prophet in 1831 revelations: "Thou shalt love thy wife with all thy heart, and shall cleave unto her and none else" (D&C 42:22); "It is lawful that [a man] should have one wife, and they twain shall be one flesh" (D&C 49:16).

But from the early days of the church rumors hinted that Smith maintained a private position different from his public posture.³

Smith's double standard was evident early in his marriage to Emma.⁴ Linda King Newell and Valeen Tippetts Avery in their biography of Emma Smith felt that charges of impropriety against Joseph may have caused him to leave Harmony, Pennsylvania, in 1830 for Ohio:

The pleasant aspects of Emma's life, however, were being overshadowed by rumors that Joseph had an unconventional view of marriage. His and Emma's abrupt departure from Harmony in 1830 may have been because her cousin, Hiel Lewis, accused Joseph of improper conduct with women. Fifty years later he repeated thirdhand stories that Joseph attempted "to seduce E.W. (Eliza Winters)," and that Joseph and Martin Harris had said "adultery was no crime."⁵

When Smith began his revision of the Bible in 1830 he again encountered the issue of polygamy. LDS historian Glen Leonard commented:

Joseph Smith's puzzlement over biblical references prompted him to seek understanding from the Lord. While working on what has become known as the Joseph Smith Translation of the Bible (JST), he pondered the meaning of the Old Testament marriage practices described in Genesis.⁶

Further, we know that in 1831 he had given a revelation to a few trusted men to take plural wives of the "Lamanites" while doing missionary work among them. This was supposed to aid in making the American Indians a "white and delightsome" people, as promised in the Book of Mormon,⁷ through intermarriage. Todd Compton writes:

W.W. Phelps, in 1861, recorded that Smith received a revelation in Missouri on July 17, 1831, that directed Mormon men to intermarry with “Lamanite” (Native American) women. When Phelps later asked how the group in question, mostly married men, could take other wives, Smith immediately answered, “In the same manner that Abraham took Hagar and Keturah; that Jacob took Rachel, Bilhah, and Zilpah; by revelation—the saints of the Lord are always directed by revelations.” A December 1831 letter by anti-Mormon Ezra Booth supports Phelps: “It had been made known by revelation” that God wanted “a matrimonial alliance with the natives” and that God would bless them “abundantly” if they obeyed. They would also “gain a residence” in Indian lands, despite the Indian agent’s opposition. “It has been made known to one who has left his wife in the State of New York that he is entirely free from his wife, and is at pleasure to take him a wife from among the Lamanites.”⁸

In spite of Smith’s revelation, none of the missionaries seem to have obeyed this command. It also appears that none of the Indians were converted.

Mormon leaders and historians generally assert that the earliest teaching on plural marriage was given as early as 1831.⁹ However, they usually fail to mention the revelation to marry the “Lamanites.” Smith’s associates would later claim that he had taught them about plural marriage in addition to the revelation about intermarriage.¹⁰

Later there would be charges that Smith was involved with young Nancy Marinda Johnson while in Ohio in 1831-1832. Most Mormons have heard about the time that Smith and Sidney Rigdon, while staying with the Johnson family, were dragged from their beds in the middle of the night and tarred and feathered. A Dr. Dennison was brought along to “perform a surgical operation, but he declined when the time came to operate.”¹¹ The mob included former Mormons who were reportedly concerned about Smith’s financial plans. But later it was charged that one of the men was angry at Joseph for being “too familiar” with Nancy Johnson. Mormon historians discount the connection of the beatings with outrage at any misconduct by Smith, pointing out that the beatings included both Rigdon and Smith. However, it is suspicious that Dr. Dennison was brought along to castrate only Joseph, although he ended up refusing to do the surgery.¹² Why was Joseph singled out for this punishment and not Rigdon? The presence of the doctor to castrate Joseph adds credibility to the charge that Smith had behaved improperly. While the claim of an affair with Nancy in the early 1830’s isn’t definitive, it is known that she was later sealed to Smith in Nauvoo even though she was a married woman. Todd Compton relates that in 1834 Nancy Marinda married future apostle Orson Hyde. However, in Nauvoo she

was a polyandrous plural wife of Joseph Smith, a relationship that still has many puzzling aspects. She married Smith when Hyde was on a mission, and it is uncertain how much the apostle knew of the marriage.¹³

George D. Smith (no relation to Joseph Smith) in his new book *Nauvoo Polygamy*: “...but we called it celestial marriage,” relates:

The sealing of Marinda [Nancy Johnson] Hyde in April 1842 [to Joseph] consummated a relationship that had begun ten years earlier but had stalled the previous December. Between Smith’s polyandrous marriages to the Huntington sisters in late autumn 1841, he courted Marinda Nancy Johnson Hyde, wife of the absent missionary Apostle Orson Hyde.¹⁴

During the mid-1830’s Joseph Smith had an affair with a teenager named Fanny Alger, who was living in the Smith home in Ohio.¹⁵ Todd Compton lists her as Smith’s first plural wife but the evidence of an actual ceremony is weak. There is an 1896 account by Mosiah Hancock that his father performed the Smith-Alger marriage, most likely in 1833.¹⁶ Book of Mormon witness Oliver Cowdery, however, referred to Joseph’s involvement with Fanny as a “dirty, nasty, filthy affair.”¹⁷ Former LDS apostle William E. McLellin asserted that Emma caught Joseph in the barn with Fanny:

William McLellin told his account of Joseph and Fanny Alger to a newspaper reporter in 1875. “[McLellin] ...informed me of the spot where the first well authenticated case of polygamy took place, in which Joseph Smith was ‘sealed’ to the hired girl. The ‘sealing’ took place in a barn on the hay mow, and was witnessed by Mrs. Smith through a crack in the door!... Long afterwards when he visited Mrs. Emma Smith...she then and there declared on her honor that it was a fact—‘saw it with her own eyes.’”¹⁸

The early rumors of Smith’s infidelity might have been dismissed if it weren’t for his later polygamist activities, especially his marriages to women with living husbands. Taken as a whole they show a pattern of affairs throughout his life.

As these rumors spread the LDS leaders realized that they needed to do something to clear the church’s name of scandal. Richard Van Wagoner explains:

Rumors of the prophet’s relationship with Alger, whispered about

Kirtland during the summer of 1835, may have been the catalyst for the church's announcement of its official position on marriage as well as motivation for the prophet's frequent addresses on marital relationships that fall. While Smith was in Michigan his secretary, W.W. Phelps, presented to the church's 17 August 1835 General Conference a "Chapter of Rules for Marriage among the Saints." This declaration stipulated in part: "Inasmuch as this church of Christ has been reproached with the crime of **fornication, and polygamy**; we declare that we believe, that one man should have one wife; and one woman, but one husband, except in the case of death, when either is at liberty to marry again."

The assembled Saints voted to accept the statement as part of "the faith and principle of this society as a body" by canonizing it in the official *Doctrine and Covenants* of the church.¹⁹

This section on marriage was printed in every edition of the *Doctrine and Covenants* until 1876, making it possible for early LDS leaders to publicly denounce plural marriage while practicing it in private.

George Smith discusses Joseph's early acquaintance with the women who would later become his plural wives:

Joseph made other acquaintances in his early life that presaged the plural marriages he would consummate in the 1840's. His relationships in Ohio with various families and their daughters—some quite youthful at the time—allowed him to invite the young women into his further confidence when they were older. In most cases, the women were adolescents or in their twenties when he met them. About ten were pre-teens, others already thirty or above. Most were with the families in Ohio, where Smith had sent missionaries from western New York in 1830. Then Smith issued a revelation in January 1831 ordering his followers to sell their property and trek 300 miles west to Kirtland, which he designated as a city of refuge for the church's converts. He became acquainted there with some twenty-seven of the women who would later become his mates...²⁰

The next possible case of polygamy was Lucinda Morgan Harris, the widow of William Morgan, who had since remarried. Todd Compton lists her as Smith's second plural wife. Evidently the Smiths lived with the Harris's for two months in 1838. Compton states, "There is no firm date for Smith's marriage to Lucinda, but these two months are a good possibility. He often married women while he was living in the same house with them..." If the marriage didn't happen at that time, there is reason to believe Smith was married to her in the 1840's.²¹ George Smith lists Lucinda as Joseph's fifth plural wife, using the later date.²²

Nauvoo, Illinois

However one views the events in the 1830's, historians generally agree that by at least 1841 Joseph Smith was being sealed to women in some sort of marriage ceremony. George Smith observes:

The story of Joseph Smith's documented marriages after wedding Emma in 1827 opens in April 1841 [in Nauvoo, Illinois] and ends some thirty-seven wives later with his marriage to Fanny Young in November 1843. His life during those two and a half years was dizzying as he juggled land purchases, religious appointments, speeches, meetings; armed and trained a town militia; welcomed settlers and immigrants to the new town; oversaw building projects; and assumed a prominent role in the ascent municipal government. All of this in addition to pronouncing revelations, avoiding arrest and extradition orders, and entering into matrimony with over three dozen women, which meant about one new wife a month. . . .

Woven throughout this fabric of daily public life is a concealed record of courtship and marriage that can be found in diaries, autobiographies, letters, affidavits, and sealing records which confirm these events.²³

George Smith starts his list of Joseph's plural wives with Louisa Beaman in April of 1841. They were married by Joseph Bates Noble, who was married to Louisa's sister, Mary. Years later Noble would tell of marrying them "during the evening under an Elm tree in Nauvoo. The Bride disguised in a [man's] coat and hat."²⁴ When asked about the nature of the marriage, Noble stated that the marriage was consummated "for I saw him [Joseph] in bed with her [Louisa]."²⁵

George Smith comments, "Neither Smith nor Beaman left a personal account of their marriage (that has been found), but eleven other sources confirm that the ceremony did take place."²⁶ There was always a great need for secrecy as Illinois had a law against bigamy.²⁷

Nauvoo Polygamy documents Joseph Smith's thirty-seven plural wives and categorizes them as follows:

Seventeen of them were single. Three of the teenaged wives and three of those in their twenties were orphaned or separated from their parents. Unlike Louisa, fourteen of the wives were already married and typically had children.²⁸

Todd Compton starts his list of Smith's wives with Fanny Alger, fol-

lowed by Lucinda Harris, thus making Louisa Beaman Joseph's third plural wife, with a total of thirty-three. Whether the final count is thirty-three, thirty-seven or more, scholars generally agree that the list includes about a dozen women with living husbands.

In the fall of 1841 Joseph Smith took his next two wives, sisters Zina Huntington Jacobs and Presendia Huntington Buell, who were already married. By marrying Zina and Presendia, Smith disobeyed the directive given to Moses that a man was not to marry sisters. Later he would also disobey the command that a man was not to marry both a mother and daughter.²⁹

Smith had proposed to Zina in 1840, prior to her marriage to Jacobs, and was refused. Even though Zina was now married, Smith persisted in his pursuit of her. Compton tells the story:

Again according to family tradition, she and Henry saw Smith soon after the marriage and "asked why he had not come . . . he told them the Lord had made it known to him she was to be his celestial wife." Once again Zina was plunged into a quandary. Smith told them that God had commanded him to marry her. However, he apparently also told them they could continue to live together as husband and wife. According to family tradition, Henry accepted this, but Zina continued to struggle. . . .

Zina remained conflicted until a day in October, apparently, when Joseph sent [her brother] Dimick to her with a message: an angel with a drawn sword had stood over Smith and told him that if he did not establish polygamy, he would lose "his position and his life." Zina, faced with the responsibility for his position as prophet, and even perhaps his life, finally acquiesced.³⁰

She finally consented and entered into a polyandrous marriage with Smith while six months pregnant with Jacob's child.³¹ During the next six months Joseph would enter into six more polyandrous marriages.³²

Later in Utah, Jedediah M. Grant, second counselor to President Brigham Young, gave a sermon in the Tabernacle in which he confirmed that Joseph Smith asked for other men's wives:

When the family organization was revealed from heaven—the patriarchal order of God, and Joseph began, on the right and on the left, to add to his family, what a quaking there was in Israel. Says one brother to another, "Joseph says all covenants are done away, and none are binding but the new covenants; now suppose Joseph should come and say he wanted **your wife**, what would you say to that?" "I would tell him to go to hell." This was the spirit of many in the early days of this Church....

Joseph Smith's Wives

The chart below contains information from *Nauvoo Polygamy* by George D. Smith.^a Although Fanny Alger is not included in the list by George Smith [GS], Todd Compton lists her as Joseph Smith's first plural wife in his book, *In Sacred Loneliness*.^b In 1887, Andrew Jenson, assistant church historian, listed Fanny Alger as one of Smith's first plural wives in the *Historical Record*.^c The numbers in parentheses (#) represent Compton's [TC] list of Joseph's plural wives. The asterisk* in the first column [AJ] notes the twenty-seven plural wives on Jenson's list.

AJ	TC	GS	Name of Plural Wife	Marriage Date	Joseph's age	Wife's age
			Emma Hale	Jan 18 1827	21	22
*	(1)		Fanny Alger	early 1833	27	16
*	(3)	1.	Louisa Be[aj]man	April 5 1841	35	26
*	(4)	2.	Mrs. Zina Diantha Huntington (Jacobs)	Oct 27 1841	35	20
*	(5)	3.	Mrs. Presendia Lathrop Huntington (Buell)	Dec 11 1841	35	31
	(6)	4.	Agnes Moulton Coolbrith (Smith)	Jan 6 1842	36	30
*	(2)	5.	Mrs. Lucinda Pendleton (Morgan Harris)	after Jan 17 1842	36	40
*	(8)	6.	Mrs. Mary Elizabeth Rollins (Lightner)	Feb 1842	36	23
*	(7)	7.	Mrs. Sylvia Porter Sessions (Lyon)	Feb 8 1842	36	23
	(9)	8.	Mrs. Patty Bartlett (Sessions)	Mar 9 1842	36	47
*	(12)	9.	Mrs. Sarah M. Kingsley (Howe Cleveland)	after Mar 1842	36	53
	(10)	10.	Mrs. Elizabeth Davis (G. Brackenbury Durfee)	after Mar 1842	36	50
	(10)	11.	Mrs. Marinda Nancy Johnson (Hyde)	April 1842	36	26
	(13)	12.	Delcena Diadamia Johnson (Sherman)	approx. June 1842	36	35
*	(14)	13.	Eliza Roxcy Snow	June 29 1842	36	38
		14.	Mrs. Sarah Rapson (Poulterer)	after July 1842	36	49
*	(15)	15.	Sarah Ann Whitney	July 27 1842	36	17
	(16)	16.	Martha McBride (Knight)	after Aug 5 1842	36	37
*	(17)	17.	Mrs. Ruth Daggett Vose (Sayers)	Feb 1843	37	35
*	(18)	18.	Flora Ann Woodworth	Mar 4 1843	37	16
*	(19)	19.	Emily Dow Partridge	Mar 4 1843	37	19
*	(20)	20.	Eliza Maria Partridge	Mar 8 1843	37	22
*	(21)	21.	Almera Wood[w]ard Johnson	after Apr 25 1843	37	29
*	(22)	22.	Lucy Walker	May 1 1843	37	17
*	(23)	23.	Sarah Lawrence	May 11 1843	37	16
*	(24)	24.	Maria Lawrence	approx. May 1843	37	19
*	(25)	25.	Helen Mar Kimball	approx. May 1843	37	14
*	(27)	26.	Mrs. Elvira Anna Cowles (Holmes)	June 1 1843	37	29
*	(28)	27.	Rhoda Richards	June 12 1843	37	58
*	(26)	28.	Hannah S. Ellis	mid -1843	37	30
		29.	Mary Ann Frost (Stearns Pratt)	July 24 1843	37	34
*	(30)	30.	Olive Grey Frost	mid-1843	37	27
*	(32)	31.	Nancy Maria Winchester	after mid-1843	37	14
*	(29)	32.	Desdemona Catlin Wadsworth Fullmer	after July 1843	37	33
*	(31)	33.	Melissa Lott	Sept 20 1843	37	19
		34.	Sarah Scott (Mulholland)	after Oct 25 1843	37	26
		35.	Mrs. Phebe Watrous (Woodworth)	after Oct 29 1843	37	38
		36.	Mary Huston	approx. Oct 1843	37	25
*	(33)	37.	Fanny Young (Carr Murray)	Nov 2 1843	37	55

a George D. Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, pp. 621-623.

b Todd Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, pp. 4-6.

c Andrew Jenson, *Historical Record*, 1887, vol. 6, pp. 233-234.

What would a man of God say, who felt aright, when Joseph asked him for his money? He would say, "Yes, and I wish I had more to help to build up the kingdom of God." Or if he came and said, "**I want your wife?**" "O yes," he would say, "here she is, there are plenty more."... Did the Prophet Joseph want every man's wife he asked for? He did not... If such a man of God should come to me and say, "I want your gold and silver, **or your wives,**" I should say, "Here they are, I wish I had more to give you, take all I have got."³³

When Brigham Young returned from his missionary trip to England in 1841 he was soon introduced to the secret practice.³⁴ Brigham later stated:

Some of my brethren know what my feelings were at the time Joseph revealed the doctrine;...it was the first time in my life that I had desired the grave, and I could hardly get over it for a long time and when I saw a funeral, I felt to envy the corpse its situation,...³⁵

However, once converted he was diligent in expanding his kingdom, eventually marrying fifty-five women.³⁶ Years later Brigham Young would proclaim “The only men who become Gods, even the Sons of God, are those who enter into polygamy.”³⁷

Publicly Exposed

In April of 1842 Joseph Smith secretly approached Nancy Rigdon, the nineteen-year-old daughter of Sidney Rigdon, to be his wife but was refused. Shortly after that Smith sent her a letter, laying out his rationale for undertaking an action that on the surface might appear wrong. Even though she was instructed to destroy the letter after reading it she saved the letter, which was later published in the August 19, 1842, *Sangamo Journal* and then in John C. Bennett’s *History of the Saints*. It read in part:

Happiness is the object and design of our existence; and will be the end thereof, if we pursue the path that leads to it; and this path is virtue, uprightness, faithfulness, holiness, and *keeping all the commandments of God*; but we cannot keep ALL the commandments without first *knowing* them . . . That which is wrong under one circumstance, may be, and often is, right under another. . . . *Whatever God requires is right*, NO MATTER WHAT IT IS, although we may not see the reason thereof till long after the events transpire.³⁸

Emma Smith’s biographers describe the confrontation that followed:

Nancy Rigdon showed the letter to her father. Rigdon immediately sent for Joseph, who reportedly denied everything until Sidney thrust the letter in his face. George W. Robinson, Nancy’s brother-in-law, claimed he witnessed the encounter and said Joseph admitted that he had spoken with Nancy but that he had only been testing her virtue.³⁹

Even though Sidney Rigdon was a member of the first presidency and stayed in the church, the event put a strain on Smith and Rigdon’s friendship.

A couple of months later Brigham Young would face a similar situa-

tion. He was first married at age twenty-three in 1824, then widowed a few years later. After converting to Mormonism he married Mary Ann Angell in 1834. Years later he secretly entered plural marriage, taking Lucy Ann Decker Seely, possibly separated from her husband, as his plural wife in June of 1842.⁴⁰ But his next attempt at courting turned into a public scandal.

Brigham Young approached a young English convert, Martha Brotherton, but was rejected. Her story was then published in the *St. Louis Bulletin* on July 15, 1842. She made a sworn affidavit that Heber C. Kimball escorted her to a private meeting with Brigham Young where she was locked in the room and pressured to marry Brigham Young in polygamy. Martha gave this report of the meeting:

B[righam] Y[oung]: Well, what are your feelings toward me?

M[artha] B[rotherton]: My feelings are just the same towards you that they ever were, sir.

BY: But to come to the point more closely, have not you an affection for me, that, were it lawful and right, you could accept of me for your husband and companion?

MB: If it was lawful and right perhaps I might; but you know, sir, it is not.

BY: Well, brother Joseph has had a revelation from God that it is lawful and right for a man to have two wives; ... and if you will accept of me I will take you straight to the celestial kingdom; and if you will have me in this world, I will have you in that which is to come, and brother Joseph will marry us here today, and you can go home this evening, and your parents will not know any thing about it.

MB: Sir, I should not like to do anything of the kind without the permission of my parents.

BY: Well, you are of age, are you not?

MB: No, sir, I shall not be until the 24th of May.

BY: Well, that does not make any difference. You will be of age before they know, and you need not fear. . . .

MB: I want time to think about it.

BY: Well, I will have a kiss any how.⁴¹

When it was obvious that she was hesitant to accept his proposal Joseph Smith was brought into the room to try and convince her:

J[oseph] S[mith]: Well, Martha, it is lawful and right before God. I know it is. Look here, don't you believe in me? Well Martha, just go ahead and do as Brigham wants you to, he is the best man in the world except me. . . . Yes, and I know that this is lawful and right before God, and if there is any sin in it I will answer for it before God, and I have the keys of the kingdom, and whatever I bind on earth is bound in heaven, and whatever I loose on earth is loosed in heaven; and if you will accept of Brigham, you shall be blessed. God shall bless you, and

my blessing shall rest upon you, and if you will be led by him, you will do well; for I know Brigham will take care of you, and if he don't do his duty to you, come to me and I will make him; and if you do not like it in a month or two, come to me and I will make you free again; and if he turns you off I will take you on.

M[artha] B[rotherton]: Sir, it will be too late to think in a month or two after. I want time to think first.⁴²

Finally, after Martha was able to convince them that she needed time to pray about it and that she would tell no one of the conversation, she was allowed to leave the room. The next day she wrote down the conversation and soon left for St. Louis. Her statement was given wide distribution in various newspapers and was included in ex-Mormon John C. Bennett's 1842 expose, *History of the Saints*.⁴³ However, Joseph and his brother Hyrum continued to make public denials of any such doctrine or practice. Richard Van Wagoner comments:

Even before Martha left Nauvoo, rumors of the incident began to circulate. Hyrum Smith, believing Joseph's public posture that polygamy was not being practiced, publicly addressed the Saints on 7 April 1842 "in contradiction of a report in circulation about Elders Heber C. Kimball, Brigham Young, himself, and others of the Twelve, alleging that a sister had been shut in a room for several days, and that they had endeavored to induce her to believe in having two wives." Joseph, who addressed the group after Hyrum, added, "There is no person that is acquainted with our principles who would believe such lies."⁴⁴

Martha's statement would cost her dearly. The LDS newspaper, *The Wasp*, edited by Joseph Smith's brother, printed a stinging denunciation of her and John C. Bennett on August 27, 1842. It charged that Martha Brotherton and all such females were "mean harlots." Brigham Young's denial, issued the same day as the *Wasp* article, stated, "I do hereby testify that the affidavit of Miss Martha Brotherton ... is a base falsehood, with regard to any private intercourse or unlawful conduct or conversation with me."⁴⁵

George Smith explains that "Brotherton eventually returned to England, where she died in 1864. But on August 1, 1870, in Salt Lake City, Brigham Young achieved his romantic pursuit when he had Brotherton sealed to him for eternity. Her sister, Elizabeth Brotherton Pratt, plural wife of Apostle Parley Pratt, acted as proxy for the deceased."⁴⁶

While Joseph Smith was publicly denying any doctrine or practice of plural marriage, he was secretly taking more wives. Only a week after

Martha Brotherton's accusations were printed in the *St. Louis Bulletin*, Smith convinced seventeen-year-old Sarah Ann Whitney to be his plural wife. However, the transaction was carefully kept from Emma Smith. Richard Van Wagoner relates:

He [Joseph Smith] was walking a tightrope, secretly courting both thirty-eight-year-old Eliza R. Snow and seventeen-year-old Sarah Ann Whitney, while fighting extradition to Missouri as "an accessory to an assault with intent to kill" former governor Lilburn W. Boggs. Smith was also at odds with his long-time friend and counselor Sidney Rigdon over a reputed polygamous proposal on 9 April 1842 to Rigdon's unmarried daughter Nancy.⁴⁷

In a footnote Van Wagoner tells more of the Whitney story:

She [Sarah Ann Whitney] was sealed to Smith with her parents' permission on 27 July 1842. In an 18 August 1842 letter to the Whitneys, Smith, hiding from Missouri law enforcement officials, detailed his problems in getting to see Sarah Ann without Emma's knowledge. "My feelings are so strong for you since what has passed [*sic*] lately between us . . . if you three would come and see me in this my lonely retreat, it would afford me great relief, of mind, if those with whom I am allied, do love me, now is the time to Afford me succor . . . the only thing to be careful is to find out when Emma comes then you cannot be safe, but when she is not here, there is the most perfect safety"⁴⁸

Any youthful dreams of courtship and a public marriage were sacrificed to gain Smith's promise of eternal exaltation for herself and her parents. Both Todd Compton and George Smith list Sarah Ann as Joseph's fifteenth plural wife.

Six weeks after marrying Sarah Ann Whitney Joseph made another public denial of plural marriage. Due to Bennett's expose and the ongoing rumors of polygamy Joseph Smith printed the following in the September 1, 1842, *Times and Seasons*:

Inasmuch as the public mind has been unjustly abused through the fallacy of Dr. Bennett's letters, we make an extract on the subject of *marriage*, showing the rule of the church . . . from the Book of Doctrine and Covenants, and is **the only rule allowed by the church**. . . "Inasmuch as this church of Christ had been reproached with **the crime of fornication, and polygamy**: we declare that we believe, that

one man should have **one wife**; and **one woman**, but **one husband**, except in case of death, when either is at liberty to marry again.”⁵⁰

In spite of such denials Joseph continued to take more wives and he expanded the number of men involved in the practice. George Smith lists five men who were living in plural marriage in 1842: Joseph Smith, Brigham Young, Heber Kimball, Vinson Knight and Reynolds Cahoon. Joseph had sixteen plural wives, the others had one plural wife each.⁵¹

Joseph Smith introduced the new teaching to his secretary, William Clayton, in February of 1843. Upon hearing that Clayton had formed a special friendship with a woman while doing missionary work in England, Smith used this as an opening to teach him the new doctrine. He instructed Clayton to send to England for the woman and marry her in polygamy. Joseph explained “It is your privilege to have all the wives you want.” However, when Sarah Crooks arrived in Nauvoo she rejected Clayton’s offer.⁵²

In the meantime Clayton had taken his wife’s sister, Margaret, as his second wife. Upon learning of her pregnancy and fearing public exposure, Clayton took the matter to Joseph. George Smith explains:

With such access to the church president, Clayton not only captured the tone of the invitation to marry when Smith said “you have a right to get all you can.” He bequeathed to us Smith’s plan for keeping such obvious marriages secret. After Margaret became pregnant in May or June 1843, Clayton wrote on October 19 about needing to *protect “the truth” by telling untruths*, in this case the strategic charade of publicly rebuking someone while privately embracing them. Clayton wrote about Smith’s advice: “Says he[,] just keep her [Margaret] at home and brook it and if they raise trouble about it and bring you before me I will give you an awful scourging and probably cut you off from the church and then I will baptize you and set you ahead as good as ever.”⁵³

The secrecy surrounding polygamy even led to problems for young men trying to court the girls in Nauvoo:

When nineteen-year-old Orange Wight noticed the attractive sixteen-year-old Flora Woodworth one spring day in 1843, how could he have known she was already married, and was even a secret wife of the Mormon prophet? He had returned home from a year-long mission to the eastern United States and was not yet familiar with the changed social landscape in Nauvoo. He was surprised to discover that many of the young women he wanted to befriend were someone else’s secret wives.⁵⁴

When Did Emma Know?

While Emma did not see Joseph's revelation on polygamy until Hyrum Smith read it to her in July of 1843, she had to know of the rumors in the 1830's of Smith's connection to other women. At least by 1842 she had to be aware of Martha Brotherton, Nancy Rigdon and John C. Bennett's accusations. She may have initially hoped that it was only a matter of a few indiscretions, not a doctrine promoted by her husband.

The Smith's home in Nauvoo was large enough to allow boarders. Emma may not have been aware of the convenience this arrangement offered Smith in his courting and marrying single women. Many of Joseph's wives first came to the home as boarders or helpers.

Several times Emma seemed to accept plural marriage only to change her mind later. Evidently Joseph had tried on a number of occasions to convince her it was of God and necessary for her salvation. Finally, after assuring her that with acceptance she would also be sealed eternally to Joseph, she agreed to his marrying two sets of sisters, ranging in age from sixteen to twenty-two, who were living in the home.⁵⁵

One of his wives, Emily Partridge, gave a statement in 1887 regarding her two marriages to Smith in the spring of 1843:

...the Prophet Joseph and his wife Emma offered us a home in their family, and they treated us with great kindness. We had been there about a year when the principle of plural marriage was made known to us, and I was married to Joseph Smith on the 4th of March, 1843, Elder Heber C. Kimball performing the ceremony. My sister Eliza was also married to Joseph a few days later. This was done without the knowledge of Emma Smith. Two months afterwards she consented to give her husband two wives, provided he would give her the privilege of choosing them. She accordingly chose my sister Eliza and myself, and to save family trouble Brother Joseph thought it best to have another ceremony performed. Accordingly on the 11th of May, 1843, we were sealed to Joseph Smith a second time, in Emma's presence, she giving her free and full consent thereto. From that very hour, however, Emma was our bitter enemy. We remained in the family several months after this, but things went from bad to worse until we were obliged to leave the house and find another home.⁵⁶

Before the Partridge sisters left the home, Emma had several confrontations with them and Joseph, demanding that there be an end to their marriages. Emily recounted that "Emma said some very hard things—Joseph should give us up or blood should flow." She went on to relate, "Joseph came to us and shook hands with us, and the understanding was that all had

ended between us.” Summing it all up, Emily stated “I am ashamed to say, I felt indignant towards Joseph for submitting to Emma, but I see now he could do no different.”⁵⁷ Such accounts destroy the well-polished image of Joseph and Emma’s happy marriage that is promulgated today.

Joseph now approached young Lucy Walker, who would become his twenty-second plural wife. Todd Compton relates:

Lucy was another young wife of Smith—he proposed to her when she was fifteen or sixteen. In her story we find the familiar pattern of the teenage girl living in the Mormon leader’s house, whom Joseph then approaches and marries.⁵⁸

The Walker family had converted to Mormonism several years before moving to Nauvoo. In the summer of 1841 the mother, Lydia, contracted malaria due to the swampy conditions in Nauvoo and finally died on January 18, 1842. Lucy recalled, “When at length we were forced to believe she would not speak to us again we were in the depths of despair. Ten motherless children!”⁵⁹ Joseph soon came up with a solution. The father was sent on a mission to the east, the younger children were sent to other families and at least two of the older siblings, Lorin and Lucy, were taken in by the Smith’s. Shortly after this division of the family one of the younger children died.

In the midst of all this sorrow and loneliness, Joseph approached sixteen-year-old Lucy Walker in late 1842 about plural marriage. Todd Compton outlines Lucy’s resistance:

When Smith sensed resistance, as has been seen, he generally continued teaching—asking the prospective wife to pray about the principle,... So it happened here. “He said, ‘If you will pray sincerely for light and understanding in relation thereto, you Shall receive a testimony of the correctness of this principle.’ ” Lucy was horrified by polygamy and by his proposal and did not quickly gain the promised testimony. She prayed, she wrote, but not with faith. She was nearly suicidal: “tempted and tortured beyond endurance until life was not desirable. Oh that the grave would kindly receive me that I might find rest on the bosom of my dear mother.” Lucy now felt intensely the absence of her parents: “Why—Why Should I be chosen from among thy daughters, Father, I am only a child in years and experience. No mother to council; no father near to tell me what to do, in this trying hour. Oh let this bitter cup pass. And thus I prayed in the agony of my soul.”⁶⁰

Then in the spring of 1843, while Lucy’s brother and Emma were in St.

Louis, Joseph pressed the issue again.⁶¹ Lucy took the matter to God in prayer and finally felt she had received divine approval. Todd Compton relates:

On May 1 [1843] Lucy, who had turned seventeen the day before, married Smith at his home, with William Clayton officiating and Eliza Partridge standing witness.⁶²

Later that month Joseph married two other girls who were staying with the Smiths, Sarah and Maria Lawrence, evidently with Emma's consent. Linda Newell and Valeen Avery provide this background:

The Lawrence sisters had come to Nauvoo from Canada without their parents in 1840 when Maria was about eighteen and Sarah fifteen. Emma and Joseph offered them a home. According to William Law's account, the girls had inherited about eight thousand dollars in "English gold." Law said, "Joseph got to be appointed their guardian," and indicated that he [Law] and Sidney Rigdon were bondsmen to Joseph. After Emma approved of the Lawrence marriages, William Law accused her of doing so with an eye to helping Joseph secure the inheritance. Joseph's history dated May 30, 1843, reads, "I superintended the preparation of papers to settle the Lawrence estate," and four days later the "accounts of the Lawrence estate were presented to the pro-bate judge, to which he made objection."⁶³

Five days after watching Joseph be sealed to the Lawrence sisters Emma was rewarded with her own sealing to Joseph for time and all eternity. But evidently struggling with jealousy, Emma fell back into her old pattern of resisting the practice of plural marriage.

Even though Emma forced the Partridge sisters to leave the home she evidently allowed the Lawrence girls to stay. Lucy Walker stayed as well, but Emma may not have known of her marriage to Smith. But Joseph's marriage to Maria Lawrence would become the last straw for Smith's counselor William Law who would bring charges of adultery against Smith in May of 1844.

Finally Joseph's brother Hyrum convinced Joseph to dictate the revelation and he would take it to Emma and convince her once and for all of its truth. William Clayton, who wrote the revelation as Smith dictated it, provided this account:

On the morning of the 12th of July, 1843; Joseph and Hyrum Smith came into the office.... They were talking on the subject of plural marriage. Hyrum said to Joseph, "If you will write the revelation on celestial marriage, I will take it and read it to Emma, and I believe I

can convince her of its truth, and you will hereafter have peace.” Joseph smiled and remarked, “You do not know Emma as well as I do.” ... Hyrum then took the revelation to read to Emma. Joseph remained with me [William Clayton] in the office until Hyrum returned. When he came back, Joseph asked how he had succeeded. Hyrum replied that he had never received a more severe talking to in his life....

Joseph quietly remarked, “I told you you did not know Emma as well as I did.” Joseph then put the revelation in his pocket.... Two or three days after the revelation was written Joseph related to me and several others that Emma had so teased, and urgently entreated him for the privilege of destroying it, that he became so weary of her teasing, and to get rid of her annoyance, he told her she might destroy it and she had done so, but he had consented to her wish in this matter to pacify her, realizing that he ... could rewrite it at any time if necessary.⁶⁴

According to Todd Compton, Joseph Smith married approximately two dozen women by July of 1843, most of them without Emma’s knowledge or consent.⁶⁵ While Smith’s revelation is dated July 12, 1843, it was not included in the LDS canon until 1876. Prior to that date the 1835 section denouncing polygamy was included in every printing of the *Doctrine and Covenants*. Thus Smith and various church leaders could publicly appeal to that section to demonstrate that they did not promote polygamy. This raises the problem of Joseph publicly lying about the very thing he was practicing in private. The revelation on polygamy is still printed in the current *Doctrine and Covenants*, section 132.

1 Editor Scott Faulring, *American Prophet’s Record*, Signature Books, 1987, p. 4.

2 Book of Mormon, Jacob 2:23-25.

3 Richard Van Wagoner, *Mormon Polygamy: A History*, Signature Books, 1989, second edition, p. 4.

4 Dan Vogel, *Joseph Smith: The Making of a Prophet*, Signature Books, 2004, pp. 178, 514.

5 Linda King Newell and Valeen Tippetts Avery, *Mormon Enigma: Emma Hale Smith*, University of Illinois Press, 1994, second edition, p. 64.

6 Glen M. Leonard, *Nauvoo: A Place of Peace, A People of Promise*, Deseret Book, 2002, p. 343.

7 Book of Mormon, 2 Nephi 30:6. “...their scales of darkness shall begin to fall from their eyes; and many generations shall not pass away among them, save they shall be a **white** and a delightsome people.” In 1981 the word “white” was changed to “pure.” In spite of this change the book still promotes a racist view of American Indians. See 2 Nephi 5:21 and 3 Nephi 2:12-15.

8 Todd Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness: The Plural Wives of Joseph Smith*, Signature Books, 1997, p. 27.

9 *Doctrine and Covenants Student Manual*—Religion 324-325, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 2001, p. 327.

10 Leonard, *Nauvoo*, p. 344; Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, p. 64.

11 *Journal of Discourses*, Latter-day Book Depot, vol. 11, p. 5; Fawn M. Brodie, *No Man Knows My History*, Random House, 1971, p. 119.

12 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, pp. 230-231, 238; Van Wagoner, *Mormon Polygamy*, pp. 4-5, 13.

13 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, pp. 228-229, 232.

14 George D. Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy: “...but we called it celestial marriage,”* Signature Books, 2008, p. 116.

15 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, pp. 38-44.

16 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, pp. 32-33.

17 *Ibid.*, pp. 26-28, 34-35, 38-39.

18 Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, p. 66.

19 Van Wagoner, *Mormon Polygamy*, p. 6; 1835 *Doctrine and Covenants*, section 101.

20 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 30.

21 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, p. 49.

22 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 621.

23 *Ibid.*, p. 54.

24 *Ibid.*, p. 59.

25 *Ibid.*, p. 63.

26 *Ibid.*, p. 57.

27 *Ibid.*, p. 3.

28 *Ibid.*, p. 63.

29 Leviticus 18:17-18; 20:14.

30 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, pp. 80-81.

31 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 75.

32 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, pp. 4-5.

33 *Journal of Discourses*, vol. 2, pp. 13-14.

34 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 47.

35 *Journal of Discourses*, vol. 3, p. 266.

36 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 635.

37 *Journal of Discourses*, vol. 11, p. 269.

- 38 John C. Bennett, *History of the Saints*, Leland & Whiting, 1842, pp. 243-244. Emphasis in original.
- 39 Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, pp. 111-112.
- 40 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 262.
- 41 H. Michael Marquardt, *The Rise of Mormonism: 1816-1844*, Xulon Press, 2005, p. 564.
- 42 Marquardt, *The Rise of Mormonism*, p. 565.
- 43 Bennett, *History of the Saints*, pp. 236-240.
- 44 Van Wagoner, *Mormon Polygamy*, p. 20.
- 45 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 270.
- 46 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, pp. 271-272.
- 47 Van Wagoner, *Mormon Polygamy*, pp. 31-32.
- 48 *Ibid.*, pp. 48-49, footnote 3.
- 49 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, p. 6; Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 622.
- 50 *Time and Seasons*, vol. 3, September 1, 1842, p. 909.
- 51 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 311.
- 52 *Ibid.*, pp. 244-245.
- 53 *Ibid.*, p. 247, italics in original.
- 54 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 414.
- 55 Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, pp. 142-143
- 56 Andrew Jenson, *Historical Record*, May 1887, p. 240.
- 57 Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 180.
- 58 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, p. 458.
- 59 *Ibid.*, p. 461.
- 60 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, p. 464.
- 61 Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, p. 132; Smith, *Nauvoo Polygamy*, p. 193.
- 62 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, p. 465.
- 63 Newell and Avery, *Mormon Enigma*, p. 144.
- 64 *History of the Church*, Introduction to vol. 5, Deseret Book, 1976, pp. xxxii-xxxiii.
- 65 Compton, *In Sacred Loneliness*, pp. 4-6.

Used by permission.

Part II to follow in next issue.

QUIZ - CONNECTING CULTS/RELIGIONS WITH GEOGRAPHY

1. Where is Shintoism the dominant religion
 a. Indonesia
 b. Myomar
 c. Korea
 d. Japan
2. Where Voodooism is very prevalent
 a. Argentina
 b. Haiti
 c. Greenland
 d. French Morocco
3. Where Confucianism once flourished
 a. Philippines
 b. India
 c. China
 d. Tibet
4. Where the Kurds have a large population
 a. Romania
 b. Afghanistan
 c. Bulgaria
 d. Turkey
5. Where atheism is stronger than any other religious persuasion
 a. Czech Republic
 b. USA
 c. Germany
 d. England
6. Where animism is most culturally engrained
 a. Balkan countries
 b. Baltic countries
 c. Sub-Sahara Africa
 d. North Africa

7. Where the Orthodox Church is the strongest religious group
 ___ a. Greece
 ___ b. Nigeria
 ___ c. Germany
 ___ d. Poland
8. Where Hindus and Muslims often conflict
 ___ a. Iran
 ___ b. India
 ___ c. Ukraine
 ___ d. Libya
9. Where the Reformers, Ulrich Zwingli and John Calvin, lived
 ___ a. Italy
 ___ b. Switzerland
 ___ c. Austria
 ___ d. Netherlands
10. Where the Kaaba stone is a centerpiece of worship
 ___ a. Jordan
 ___ b. Ethiopia
 ___ c. Ireland
 ___ d. Saudi Arabia

Answers:

1. (d); 2. (b); 3. (c); 4. (d); 5. (a); 6. (c); 7. (a); 8. (b); 9. (b); 10. (d)

SUBSCRIBERS

If your mailing label reads June 2009 and is Vol. 29, No. 2, your subscription expires with this issue. Please renew your subscription soon. Renewals cost \$10.00 per year in the US. Foreign subscriptions cost extra to cover the additional postage.

Come visit Religion Analysis Service on the world wide web!

Our URL is: <http://www.ras.org>

Our e-mail address is: info@ras.org

RELIGION ANALYSIS SERVICE, INC.

1313 5th St. SE, Suite 126E,
Minneapolis, MN 55414-4504

Address Service Requested

Non Profit Org.
U.S. Postage
Paid
Minneapolis, MN
Permit No. 795

**Important- If your mailing label
reads June 2009, your subscrip-
tion has expired with this issue.
Please renew now!**
